



THE JEWISH CHRONICLE
25 FURNIVAL STREET
LONDON EC4A 1JT, UK
T 020 7415 1500
www.thejc.com

Donor hypocrisy

Heaven forfend that any member of the Beth Din ever has need of an organ donation. But there can be no clearer demonstration of the wrong-headedness of the Chief Rabbi's new guidelines than that there appears to be no rabbinic bar on receiving an organ freely given, but an unambiguous statement that it is wrong for a Jew to carry an organ donor card. This is not just hypocrisy; it leaves a nasty taste in the mouth. The supposed halachic justification – that Judaism only recognises cardio-respiratory death, while under current arrangements organs are often removed when there is brain-stem death – is rejected in Israel and is blinkered and profoundly misguided. And it is completely unrealistic for the Beth Din to demand that the wording on donor cards be altered and the National Organ Donor Registry change its methodology just to comply with their ruling. Thankfully many in all wings of our community already carry cards and will, surely, treat the ruling how it deserves to be treated: by ignoring it.